

**OGS NYSPRO Pricing Analysis for NYSID's Digital Printing Application**

| Paper/Page Specification  | NYSID Application Sample Pricing (Per Page) | Utilizing Another State Agency Bid   |  | Utilizing other unnamed customer BID        |  | Utilizing other unnamed customer BID                       |   |                                  | Utilizing other State Agency BID             |   | Utilizing other State Agency BID                   |   | PREFERRED SOURCE PROPOSAL                                      |  | Utilizing other State Agency BID |                              |
|---|---|--|--|---|--|--|---|----------------------------------|--|---|--|---|--|--|----------------------------------|------------------------------|
|   |   | NYSID Proposed Price for SUNY Albany Undergraduate Bulletin Price Per Page | NYSID proposed price SUNY v. NYSID Application | Snyder Printing (PIA) Per Page (See Note 6) | Snyder V. NYSID Application (See Note 6) | NYSID IFB Pricing Provided 3/31/2014 Per Page (See Note 6) | NYSID IFB 3/30/2014 V. NYSID Application (See Note 6) | Snyder V. NYSID IFB (See Note 6) | NYS DOH Amsterdam Printing Contract Per Page | NYS DOH Amsterdam Printing V. NYSID Application | Tobay Printing Co. PC65367 (See Notes 7, 8, and 9) | Tobay Printing Co. V. NYSID Application (See Notes 7, 8, and 9) | Camelot/NYSID OGS Finance October 2014 (See Notes 7, 8, and 9) | Camelot/NYSID OGS Finance V. NYSID Application (See Notes 7, 8, and 9) | OGS Printing Contract PC65303    | PC65303 V. NYSID Application |
| 1 Sided Black 60LB 8.5 x 11" Capital District Region/Hudson Valley1000    | 0.0177                                      | 0.0130   | -36.15%  | N/A   | N/A                                      | N/A  | N/A   | N/A                              | N/A  | N/A   | 0.1500   | -630.13%  | \$0.1723   | -461.80%   | N/A                              | N/A                          |
| 2 sided black60LB 8.5 x 11" Capital District Region/Hudson Valley 1000    | \$0.0315                                    | N/A  | N/A  | N/A   | N/A                                      | N/A  | N/A   | N/A                              | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A  | N/A                              | N/A                          |
| 1 Sided 4 color 60LB 8.5 x 11" Capital District Region/Hudson Valley 1000 | 0.1258                                      | \$0.0100   | -1158.00%                                      | N/A   | N/A                                      | N/A  | N/A   | N/A                              | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A  | N/A                              | N/A                          |
| 2 sided 4 color 60LB 8.5 x 11" Capital District Region/Hudson Valley 1000 | \$0.2173                                    | N/A  | N/A  | 0.0559                                      | -289.01%                                 | 0.0947   | -129.51%  | N/A                              | \$0.0170                                     | -1179.74%                                       | 0.0660   | -1459.61%   | \$0.0758   | -\$14.41   | N/A                              | N/A                          |
| 17 x 22 70lb Cougar Natural Opaque White Text Brochures (1000)            | N/A   | N/A  | N/A  | 0.0235                                      | N/A                                      | 0.0273   | N/A   | -16.17%                          | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A  | N/A                              | N/A                          |
| 17 x 22 70lb Cougar Natural Opaque White Text Brochures (1000)            | N/A   | N/A  | N/A  | 0.0235                                      | N/A                                      | 0.0273   | N/A   | -16.17%                          | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A  | N/A                              | N/A                          |
| 8-3/8 x 10-1/2 70lb Endurance Recycled Text, FSC< 10% pcw                 | N/A   | N/A  | N/A  | 0.3625                                      | N/A                                      | 0.2670   | N/A   | 26.33%                           | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A  | N/A                              | N/A                          |
| 8-3/8 x 10-1/2 70lb Endurance Recycled Text, FSC< 10% pcw                 | N/A   | N/A  | N/A  | 0.3473                                      | N/A                                      | 0.2540   | N/A   | 26.86%                           | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A  | N/A                              | N/A                          |
| 8-3/8 x 10-1/2 70lb Endurance Recycled Text, FSC< 10% pcw                 | N/A   | N/A  | N/A  | 0.3367                                      | N/A                                      | 0.2540   | N/A   | 24.56%                           | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A  | N/A                              | N/A                          |
| 65# 8.5 x 11 Black & White , White Cover (100)                            | \$2.35                                      | N/A  | N/A  | N/A   | N/A                                      | N/A  | N/A   | N/A                              | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A   | \$2.5275   | -30.56%  | N/A                              | N/A                          |
| 65# 8.5 x 11 Color White Cover (100)                                      | \$2.60                                      | N/A  | N/A  | N/A   | N/A                                      | N/A  | N/A   | N/A                              | N/A  | N/A   | \$3.0000   | -18.33%   | \$3.4475   | -2.97%   | N/A                              | N/A                          |
| 5 x 7 12pt White Productoloth Points C2S, 10% pcw                         | N/A   | N/A  | N/A  | 0.2600                                      | N/A                                      | 0.0889   | N/A   | 65.81%                           | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A  | N/A                              | N/A                          |
| Saddle Stitching  | \$0.95                                      | N/A  | N/A  | N/A   | N/A                                      | N/A  | N/A   | N/A                              | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A  | \$0.7310                         | -29.97%                      |
| Drilling  | \$0.50                                      | N/A  | N/A  | N/A   | N/A                                      | N/A  | N/A   | N/A                              | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A   | \$5.6000   | 10.70%   | N/A                              | N/A                          |
| Inserting   | \$0.10                                      | \$0.0212   | -372.81%                                       | N/A   | N/A                                      | N/A  | N/A   | N/A                              | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A   | N/A  | N/A  | N/A                              | N/A                          |

Notes:

1. A "negative" percentage indicates that the pricing offered on the Comparable Contract/Customer is lower than that proposed by NYSID as a sample pricing. A positive percentage indicates NYSID pricing is lower.
2. Any percentage greater than 100 indicates that the comparable pricing (e.g. The Snyder Printing Pricing) is several times either higher or lower than the NYSID Application Sample Pricing (E.G. -200% means that the comparable pricing is three times lower than the NYSID Application sample pricing).
3. NYSID did not provide data requested by OGS NYSPRO. This request was for contracts and purchase orders (including the written terms and conditions) from state agencies, authorities, municipalities, local governments, etc. for the past three (3) years. Lack of this information hindered NYSPRO's review.
4. OGS was not able to obtain comparable pricing for all printing offerings proposed by NYSID to make the apples-to-apples comparison. In addition, NYSID withdrew its proposal to offer envelopes, pocket folders, and posters larger than 14 x 26".
5. For all pricing comparisons, OGS NYSPRO used the closest comparisons (paper size, weight, color/black & white, etc.) to perform its comparisons. OGS did not include the sample pricing provided by NYSID on November 6, 2013 because two of the three contracts referenced had old pricing which is from 2009, and OGS could not determine when the third contract was established.
6. NYSID's pricing for Post Cards and 20 page booklet are lower than that offered by Snyder Printing (member of the PIA). However, the printing of this item doesn't appear to be a common printing need among state agencies.
7. NYSID and its proposed partner Camelot submitted a preferred source proposal for digital printing pricing in May of 2013 and subsequently in October of 2013 to OGS Finance (the bid was for Offset, but OGS Finance determined that Camelot/NYSID is proposing to use Digital Printing). The pricing proposed by NYSID/Camelot is higher than the sample pricing NYSID included in its application add Digital Printing.
8. The pricing on Contract PC65367 and NYSID/Camelot's proposal both included Saddle Stitching in the cost of the printing material. To reflect this, when preparing the sample pricing NYSID included in its proposal plus the sample Saddle Stitching pricing NYSID included to perform an apples to apples comparison.
9. OGS Finance determined that the printing services proposed by NYSID/Camelot were over 15% above prevailing market pricing and did not meet their form, function, and utility.

Summary:

1. Competitive bids generate lower prices. The marketplace keeps pricing in check. Proposed pricing for the non-competitive conditions shows prices higher than that allowed.
2. Due to the complex nature of printing contracts, with multiple variables such as type of paper, color, ink, binding, stitching and printing methods, only a competitive bid can establish reasonableness of price